LOS ANGELES – AFRALO / AfrICANN Joint Meeting
Wednesday, October 15, 2014 – 14:00 to 15:30
ICANN – Los Angeles, USA

AZIZ HILALI: Please. Ladies and gentlemen. Could we please start?

Very well, welcome. Welcome to everyone for this new AFRALO Meeting. Our theme is going to be – it has been chosen between AFRALO and the AfrICANN community – is the IANA Transition and ICANN Accountability seen by the African community.

I thank you very much for coming after we invited you. We did distribute the project for our declaration. That's why we want to talk today and validate this declaration after some possible changes coming from our colleagues.

As we all know, six months did happen since we learned from the U.S. government about the IANA transition. The first step of the U.S. government is to ask the community to have all the stakeholders come up with a proposal for the IANA transition and the role of the U.S. government. This is a very important announcement that was made six months ago.

We have to think hard about this issue. As Africans, how are we going to contribute to the debate? How do we see this IANA transition from Africa and in the African community?

I would like to hear proposals. I think you should all agree that this declaration, if it is validated, should first be transmitted to the group. There is a group of coordination group ICG and they asked for a

proposal so our declaration would be done the ICG and it would be transmitted to the ICG Group. Mohamed Bashir is present here and he's the Vice Chair of AFRALO – Mohamed El Bashir – and they are looking for formal answers.

There is a process for that for our institutions that have operational work or direct work with the IANA transition regarding numbers and so on and addresses. And before I giving the floor to our guest, we see Olivier is a little bit far away, but he's tired to be playing that role I think.

And, I would like to thank very warmly the Drafting Committee that did a lot of work and I would like to thank Fatimata. We are so glad to see her, Fatimata Seye Sylla. I do thank her so much. She was away for too long.

We have the members of this Drafting Committee, Seun, Tijani, Hadja, Ben Fuller, Mohamed El Bashir, Barrack Otieno, and Said Mchangama.

Without further ado, you have our agenda. I do not know if you want to add something, but I'm going to give the floor to Olivier. Crépin-Leblond, ALAC Chair. The outgoing ALAC Chair is going to have a few minutes to express himself.

OLIVIER. CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much Mr. Chairman. My name is Olivier Crépin-Leblond. I have only two more days as ALAC Chair and now I have to move to other places around the table. I'm not in front of the sunlight anymore.

This is always a pleasure to be part of this meeting. Every time we meet at ICANN, every time, we have a new resolution that we have to work

on, and, it's quite important according to me that an area that is sometimes forgotten in the world region has a global vision but also a voice that should be a united voice on a continent, which is extremely diverse, which goes from north to south and has so much diversity, so many climates.

I've been to Africa. I traveled a lot and I saw some beautiful places, very different one from the other. South Africa brought me to Lesotho and Lesotho was totally different. I couldn't imagine that I was in Africa and that's not what I was expecting.

The cultures are so different. Obviously, the languages are so different and you're still able to work in a unity with this AfrICANN meeting. You only have one voice; one voice that is sent to the Board that is sent to the ICG for our resolution. I haven't found all the words in French.

But it is so important to have this perspective and I hope you're going to keep working, doing this important work, especially since I am sad to not to be able any more to join you as an ALAC Chair. You won't see me in that capacity. In the next meetings, I hope to come as a Vice President.

I will keep coming but you're going to lose two fathers and Pierre Dandjinou is by your side and Adiel Akplogan is another father. They have new perspectives next year. I don't know if Pierre may be babies for those fathers. So many changes, so many new faces, many new people that are going to come, so it's going to be a year that is going to be extremely challenging and also extremely exciting bringing a lot to us to go forward to work better altogether.

Thank you so much to enable me and to give me a few minutes to express myself. Thank you so much.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Olivier for those kind words. I have to say that Olivier was talking about Pierre [inaudible] was going to retire and Adiel Akplogan was not going to be the president of AfriNIC. Sorry Pierre. This is another Pierre and I don't think you should retire yet sir.

Pierre Dandjinou is very young still, and I'm going to give the floor to our good friend who always was on our side, Mr. Sebastian Bachollet, Board member. You have the floor.

SEBASTIAN BACHOLLET: Thank you very much, Tijani. Thank you everyone. Tijani's on my side. I'll explain to you why I did that.

In the Board for three years we had Bertrand and I were Board members and the Board chairperson called me Bertrand, called Bertrand Sebastian. So the two persons that I meet so often, with whom I work so often are Aziz and Tijani. Thank you Aziz for giving me the floor.

I'm going to keep going and after listening to Olivier I'm not going to repeat what we did. We did one trip together and that was wonderful. This continent is amazing and beautiful and be it in AFRALO, AfrICANN, or all the stakeholders from Africa, you always show the way and show us new ways of looking at things; a new vision. I hope that the rest of

EN

the community be aware of that because I think this is a practice that is extremely useful for ICANN. I'm going to give you a few examples.

When we had one of the first meetings with the RALOs in Africa, AFRALO did organize what they call the showcase. That was the first showcase. When they started, they started with training as well. The meeting that you've been organizing for a while now should be done in each and every region and what I do enjoy in those meetings, of course you get staff support, but you do the work. You put it together. In other regions if the staff doesn't help out, nothing happens.

So we're talking about bottom up multistakeholder. We have to really work so that it's a real process that goes up, and that's what you do. And, for me, your showing that we have energy, that you are very innovative, and with Tijani – and I know who I'm talking about – we worked on the evolution of the meetings, of the organization of meetings. We did work with two important elements.

One, we had to be able to organize meetings regularly in Africa and not in the same country, not in the same countries. That was extremely important and I think that it was a success and your meeting was the equivalent of the meeting in other areas. You didn't have to ask for a room. There was a meeting of all regions and now you're going to have to implement that in the future to have the ability to do more of those meetings. That's very important.

You do share two languages, French and English. You're working together and this is a very important element.

Thank you so much for your support, your help. For four years as a Board member, I always enjoyed what you brought to the debate. I noted that you didn't always agree and this is what life is all about, and I always enjoyed working with you. I don't have to change seats because I don't know where I will sit.

I'm going to go on vacation in your continent. I'm going to Mauritius and do some scuba diving and then I'm going off to think about what I want to do. We'll see. But thank you so much. I'm sure we'll meet again soon. All the best.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much for those kind words, Sebastian, and you are someone who is always on the side of African people and I know you will always support us. We wish you all the best for your vacation.

If we have no questions, we're going to go to the introductory address. We're going to start with our Global Stakeholder Vice President for Africa, Mr. Pierre Dandjinou.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you very much. It's not a speech. I'm not going to give you a speech. I'm going to give you some ideas and you react. Thank you so much for inviting me to this meeting.

This is the opportunity for me to talk about what we really have to do in Africa for engagement and more and more people are interested in that process regarding why we are meeting today. What I could say very

quickly is that this resolution with the U.S. government, this decision of the U.S. government, is extremely interesting for Africa.

Two weeks ago I was in Kigali, Smart Kigali, Smart Rwanda and we had a session about internet governance and we talked about that issue. We talked about that development I would say, and it was interesting to look in at the fact that not many people new about it and we had some high level people with ministers and CEOs and the first question they asked is to have more information about the IANA transition.

It's very important to have in our program a place when we can bring awareness to that new process to that IANA transition. What is at stake?

One minister was asking me, "Why should we be interested by that? What does that mean? That they're going to take the decisions anyway?"

And I said, "No." I answered no. This is the opportunity that you are given to influence the decisions. You have to be present. You have to be involved in the decision making process.

We were in Djibouti. AfriNIC launched an idea and that's how we started the process. We had this resolution. We have a list of people that are debating and in our community, our AfriNIC community something is being done. What I see is that all the stakeholders in Africa should be interested by this IANA transition and they have to be more aware of it.

I have a few ideas about that. I do observe a lot of what's going on in Africa. There's not one specific position but we have to understand the role of the coordinating committee, ICG, that is has been set up. We have four or five Africans involved in that process.

The role of the ICG is a platform that's going to aggregate proposals and work on those different proposals. It's going to enable for the different functions and parts to work together and those proposals are going to be delegated and going to make up a large proposal. So the ICG must work by consensus; how to reach a global consensus with all the proposals that they will receive and once they have a consensus, how they're going to develop a document that is going to be discussed, commented upon and how you're going to get legitimacy? Legitimacy is going to be a key word because this is going to be a key document.

Now, regarding the French speakers, the African-French speakers, I think that we have to work on a timeline, and since December or January, we have a lot of expectations for December/January. The African community has to keep with the deadline and respect the deadline.

How we're going to communicate together on the African continent? Sometimes communication is an issue. How the message is going to be adapted to the different partners in Africa?

We talked about governments. How are we going to work with those governments?

This is going to be very important because most governments are going to go to for a plenipotentiary meeting of the ITU and they're going to

work for several weeks, for three weeks. We see an African position that is being decided by many plenipotentiaries.

In Africa, we have to come up with a position, a common position, with ICG. We have to talk about that.

I think that what AfriNIC is doing is very positive. fTLD, do they do the same thing?

AFRALO, you did work very well on that and when I look at the documents that we're going to work on, you did propose a few prerequisites so that it works out.

We need a document. We need a proposal. We have to work on the document. This is extremely important.

I know that we have an African strategy. There is a lot to do. ICANN is only a facilitator, an enabler. Thank you very much for your attention.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Pierre. I know we would all like to wish our fellow here who's back at ICANN, would you like to take the floor about your return to ICANN? Pierre Dandjinou is back at ICANN or what do you mean?

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Hello everyone. I'm glad to be here with you all once again. I would like to talk about what Pierre just said regarding the coordination on transition of the IANA stewardship.

EN

It is paramount that we all participate so that governments and not only governments but I mean communities in general get to know what it's all about. As you know I've been working in Geneva. I'm in charge of governments and most of them know what this buzz word which is a transition of the stewardship of IANA functions is, but they don't get to relate it to ICANN or to what the IANA is and they don't actually know how they should be participating.

I was a party at two or three meetings in Geneva, because people usually come there for the ITU and we had the WIPOs general assembly and the WTO/GA recently as well. It's always people from our countries and they discuss the same matters they usually have, not only at the IANA level but also regarding the new gTLDs. All this is discussed at the level of our countries representatives but still at the WIPO and the WTO level but our countries are not keeping up and why is that?

Because they've no idea what all of this is; what the new gTLDs are, what that means to us. You all know that we've been working for a long while on drawing the attention of our communities on the protection of names, on all the potential impacts of the WHOIS and the potential clashes of our rules at the ICANN level. So, I think there is a lot of work to be done and I would like to encourage you all to participate.

Pierre, and I, and all the teams are there to try and help if at all possible and where possible so that these matters are discussed and so that this is a reality. That would be great to us all, and not just to us all but to our kids as well. Thank you.

EN

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, and we wish you a great return at the level of the African and ICANN level.

I would like to give the floor right away to another pioneer of African Internet. That would be Adiel, who's here. Can you tell us a little bit about your opinion on this transition?

ADIEL AKPLOGAN: Thank you, Aziz. I'm going to speak briefly about the IANA transition. I think that is what's the current issue at stake and I would like to draw your attention to a very important matter that ICG wanted everyone to be aware of.

The process as it was defined in the RFP that the ICG issued includes three operational communities, specifically the names community, the numbers community, and the parameters community for IP protocols. ICG clearly issued its wish to receive proposals from these three operational communities, mainly because it is easier to see the transition of IANA through these three operational communities, which are the ones that receive IANA services directly. So, it is important to us in the African region to see how our contributions can be channeled through these three operational communities. That is very important.

Secondly, of course this does not prevent other individuals, peoples, or groups send their contributions directly to the ICG but the ICGs going to consider the proposal coming from operational communities and identify whether there's conflicts with other proposals and review these possibilities. So it is very important that we take this in to account.

At the AfriNIC level Pierre spoke about it just now. We have a process in place through our mailing list and through our round table that we will be holding in Mauritius, and at the level of the numbers community in AfriNIC we have a proposal that we're all following.

Now, going back to the engagement of governments, there was a presentation this morning at the GAC level and the ICG level on what is going on. There were many contributions and in the end I got to discuss with some GAC members, and in general at the governmental level, their interest in the IANA transition is more political than operational.

Currently with the transition at the ICG level, the situation is very much operational. So the participation and the contributions of government have not yet reached a level that would be desirable to them, but I think it is also the opportunity to say this, to express this aspect by using this process that's in place.

Of course, operational communities are going to send their own proposition. The governments themselves have to, either through these different operational communities or once the proposal period will be open still, they have to issue their advice and express their opinion regarding the IANA functions.

So at the African level, we have different communities and the AfriNIC process is sure to have an impact on the global numbers process. As regards protocols and parameters, it will be global and as there is no regional level, so I'm sure we'll have to directly participate through the IETF.

What's important is that we contribute with specific contributions and specific proposals, and I think since we've only got two months to put together specific proposals, that we start thinking of specific proposals of what the transition is going to be like and how we're going to replace the role of the NTIIA. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:
Thank you for all these explanations, Adiel.

Now, a great friend, Tijani Ben Jemaa, a brother to us, a member of ALAC, and the Chair of the Mediterranean Federation of Internet Associations will have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:
Thank you. I think Pierre and Adiel have already paved the way for what I have to say. What we have to do is contribute to this transition, and Adiel was saying that it's an operational transition, which is why the governments are not interested in it, which is a great mistake to me because I think this transition comprehends the political dimension because this transition will have certain political impacts, and if the operational transition is done then the political aspect is going to be impacting and it won't be possible to change the new scenario once it's been done. I think they're not following good advice. We would have to explain this to them.

So, what can we do as the African community? I think we're going to have to participate through the three operational communities if you will. If you wish to make specific proposals and if you agree with the

EN

proposals, if we don't have a conflict, if we don't have absolutely contradictory viewpoints. So we have to go through them because this process is what matters to us.

We still have a number of weeks. But it's not much time so I don't think it's plausible, but we don't have a choice. And, I think therefore, that we have to grab the bull by the horns and try and make our contributions through these three parties.

In case we cannot express our viewpoints or in the event we would have a major conflict with these parties, we're going to need to have a different proposal, which is possible. This was confirmed to us yesterday. I thought yesterday it was impossible to have other proposals, but it was said to us yesterday and it was explained that it is possible to present other proposals, even if they don't come from one of these three parties.

So, how can we participate? How can we put together an African proposal, at least from the African ICANN community viewpoint?

I think there's two means of doing this. We can create a mailing list and we could create a wiki page. And at least I think and it would take a good moderator to do this. But I think on these two media, we should discuss everything that cannot be included into the processes of the three operational parties so that at the end in two or three weeks stops, we can put together a specific proposal that can be different from those of the operational parties, and that is going to be presented through the coordination group.

Now as regards to the statement, there's been a lot of discussions online, and I would like to say that generally the times we choose for such meetings and the subjects, which is for our usual joint meetings, are the ones that allow us to contribute on the advice we give the Board. It's got to be something useful for the community, something that matters to the community and then that we make proposals useful for us. We cannot only think of subjects that matter to us and no one alone. And in the end, they're going to tell us what we have to do.

But these meetings in any event give us the possibility of reaching the board with an idea, with a proposal, so this last statement has provoked a lot of exchanges on the mailing list regarding the contents of what we wanted to say, and even if something is no longer improvable, if we cannot do anything else to improve a situation, we still have to express our viewpoint because people need to know that we have a position. We shouldn't say now that we can no longer do anything for the make up of the ICG, for instance because we discussed diversity and all that, and we can no longer change what it is because the group is what it is. But the world needs to know that African community has a viewpoint. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Tijani, for all these clarifications. Now, Mohamed El Bashir is going to take the floor and he will give us some more details about this group since he participates at it and he is the Vice Chair.

Tijani, you spoke of deadlines. Precisely, the deadline is January 15, so perhaps Mohamed can tell us about the planning? Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Aziz. I think I will just echo what has been said.

This is a very historical moment, because if you remember, a lot of African governments and our governments were criticizing the relationship between the U.S. government and ICANN, and the role of the U.S. government oversight within ICANN within IANA function. So this is a historical milestone in terms of that oversight will disappear and actually the global Internet community is talking about it the new model that should replace that oversight. So this is a very important milestone for all of us.

We should encourage everyone really to participate, and as Adiel and Tijani said, either you can participate by involvement on the communities processes, or you can send your comments directly to ICG, which accepts comments directly.

What is ICG? Briefly, I can just tell you that ICG is a group of 30 representatives of 13 communities, including governments, including Civil Society representatives, including RIRs, communities like Adiel's, representing them, including, ccTLD managers, and root server operators. So it's basically, I can say, the global Internet community are represented in that group, and each community has either elected or appointed their representative there.

In that group, currently, we have I think it's I'm sure I know Tijani's position in terms of the African representation there , but we have I think a fairly good number of African representatives who are experienced in leading. Adiel is working on representing RIRs. Mary

Uduma from Nigeria, she's representing the ccTLDs. We have Manal Ismail from Egypt. She's representing the governments and GAC and myself as well representing the At-Large and AFRALO. I currently serve as the Vice Chair, so I think we have a good fairly African representation.

I think that the next important step is really to ensure that the community voices is somehow represented or at least echoed there. So I think your statement, the statement currently in front of you, it's important to be submitted to ICG as a formal input from the AFRALO African members here attending this meeting.

This will send a very good message to ICG that there's a wider community in Africa looking at this process, happy to get engaged, and there's a focus specifically I think in the statements to outreach and how we can ensure that we're cascading the messages down south because if we couldn't really spread out the word, we will be the same people, even us who will have been here for a long time as well, contributing to the process. We need new blood and we need you to send the message back, either to your governments or to your civil society organizations that there is a chance now just to contribute. Say anything. Submit anything. So that's very important.

The proposal development currently being done in the community is so anyone could participate. Any group who feels that they are not well represented or cannot participate for any reasons in the communities, they could submit their comments and their position directly to ICG, which will be put publicly in a public archive so anyone could see those positions. So, it's run with a very transparent approach to ensure that everyone is watching this process that is really done in a best ways.

So, I think I will just echo the comments regarding really the engagement. Please feel free to approach any ICG members either here in these sessions or during tomorrow. And, I encourage you to attend the ICG Community Meeting, which will be tomorrow at 10:00. It will be in the form of an open mike so you'll also hear from the different community members and from the different regions their views about the process.

I think we need to have a position because this is a chance so anyone who's opposing ICANN U.S. government relation that they have a chance that to say that and even propose something else and it will be put on the table.

Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Mohamed. I asked Ariel to show us the list of members of the group on the ICG. You'll see that, as was said, there are representatives from ALAC, ccNSO, GNSO, GAC, etc.

We will now go on and move on to the presentation of the subject. Fatimata Seye Sylla will be introducing this. She's our representative at the NomCom. She's the Chair of the [inaudible] and as was said, we are very glad to have her back among us. You have the floor.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you very much, Aziz. Once again, hello everyone. This time I'm here to present the statement of the African community, and I think we've exceled here.

We've done better than other times because we've been in consultation with the African Internet community and it was a larger community that was consulted on the choice of the subject and even on the drafting of the statement.

I'm not sure it's worth reading the entire statement. Okay. I'm going to read it anyway because I'm told I have to read it. There's people who were not following the discussion on the mailing list, who didn't take part in our debates.

I'm going to read it and we have two versions. There's a French version and an English version. They're both on the same page.

I'm going to be reading the French version. Those who do not speak French are welcome to listen to the interpretation because we have an interpreter translating from French into English. And so, we'll start reading the statement.

The statement is entitled: Statement of the African ICANN Community Participating in the Joint AFRALO-AfrICANN meeting in Los Angeles on "IANA Stewardship transition of the IANA functions and ICANN accountability." But this would be the stewardship mostly. The control of the stewardship transition of IANA functions and ICANN accountability. The translation is not the best.

"We, the members of the African community participating in the 51st ICANN International Public Meeting in Los Angeles California USA, have debated on Wednesday October 15th 2014, during the joint AFRALO-AfrICANN meeting the issue of IANA Stewardship transition and ICANN Accountability seen by the African Community. Taking into account

inputs from the larger African internet community, we declare what follows:

Firstly, we welcome the request from the National Telecommunications and Information Administration (NTIA) to ICANN to convene a multistakeholder process to develop a plan to transition the U.S. government stewardship role with regard to the IANA functions and related root zone management.

If you have the NTIA announcement, the ICANN accountability and the IANA stewardship transition are interrelated. We understand the challenges faced by the ICANN to ensure broad community support and meet the principles specified by the NTIA, and at the same time enhancing accountability and we appreciate ICANN's efforts towards that end. We welcome the willingness, commitment and involvement of the new direction of ICANN to ensure the participation of Africa in all aspects of the global Internet governance. We call for a bottom up prepared process – so that is bottom up – for the ICANN accountability and governance to ensure that it is community-driven. We believe that for an effective participation from the African Internet community, an effort towards awareness raising and capacity building about IANA functions and facilitation of the engagement of the African community in the process through the operational community channels (naming, numbering, protocol parameters) is drastically needed.

The African Internet community requests the operational communities the IANA coordination group (ICG) and the Accountability Coordination Group to ensure that the opinions of the Internet community in Africa and other development regions of the world be considered. The

AFRALO-AfrICANN community invites all the African internet community stakeholders to actively engage and participate in the IANA stewardship transition and the ICANN accountability and governance process.

We believe that with due consideration of those recommendations, ICANN will better succeed the multistakeholder process of preparing the IANA stewardship transition proposal and the ICANN accountability enhancement in line with its principles of inclusiveness and bottom up decision making."

I thank you for your attention. Now, I would also like to thank all the members of the group who have worked towards putting together this statement and all that they have contributed online.

That is what we have so far. Thank you. Mr. Chair.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Fatimata. It is now time to give the floor to our attendents. We have 35 minutes for debate. So, you can take the floor if you wish. Who will start? Seun?

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you very much for the session. Thank you for the statement.

I would like to first comment on the IANA transition. I think it's an opportunity for our community to actually use it to educate our community on how Internet [inaudible] is generally been [inaudible]. We currently are not taking advantage of that and once this opportunity goes by, there won't be any need for any transition again. So it's good

we use this opportunity to even encourage and educate our people to sort of help them to understand how the thing works, and maybe that will improve the future participation.

In terms of how to participate, AfriNIC already provided a medium of participating, which is there was a mailing list that has been set up. There's usually an announcement if a mission that is forwarded there once in a while, but we have not been participating in it.

And, I think one of the reasons why we have not been participating in it is because of our unique profile that we have. That is unique profiling being that we don't usually start things up. So in view of this, I think maybe I should ask if AfriNIC staff could help us simulate discussion by those discussion points that they will have provided during the AfriNIC meeting. Maybe they could send it earlier so that we can start having something to talk about even before the AfriNIC meeting. The announcements we are getting now is okay. There's a timeline but what are we discussing?

Let's help our community to talk about something. So when we're up here, they can consider doing that, maybe to submit questions and so on and so forth.

I also want to talk about leaders. I think our Africa leader, our leaders here, you know where to see the decision makers in Africa. You're not ready to meet them. We don't meet them there. We've only come to this meeting [inaudible], for instance. You go to ITU. You meet them at high-level places. Please take advantage of that in discussing these things with them personally, because we're saying go back to our

communities [inaudible] to go back to them. There's a limit to which we can talk, but I think your efforts in talking to [inaudible] really helping and making progress.

On AFRALO, I'd like to comment on our program of activities. I would suggest that we further try to leverage on the experiences of African people who have been in ICANN. Let's see how we can actually start. I was part of the drafting team of these statements, so I will not say this statement is not something that is not useful, but I will say, in a meeting like this, we should try to see how we could generate more contribution from participants who were actually coming in for the first time so they can get more information. So, when they go back home, they will be encouraged.

I saw people going out, and it looks like we are the only one. Looks like we are talking at them, and I think we need to change the format of discussion. We need to change the format with which we engage ourselves, and I would like to also mention that we need to start considering providing reports of AFRALO activities in these meetings. If people are seeing the success reports, they will be encouraged that we are doing something at least.

One other thing I would like to say is that it feels lonely in those discussion rooms. We've been able to come here. We should stand up in meetings and make our point. Some of us stand up and talk, and at times it feels like we are talking too much. It's good to be hearing those voices from different people, so I encourage also to, please, let's stand up, even if whatever it is we are saying is not right. You will be understood. So, let's stand up, and let's go to the mike. Let's pick up our

mike. That is the only way our voice can get heard, and that is the only way we can make Africa a better continent.

We are black. Africa is, in terms of internet penetration, it's just the same like our color right now. [Unless] somebody sheds the map was this on [inaudible]. The penetration is just the same to our color, because we have not done the things that we're supposed to be doing. We're the younger generations. This is also a challenge to us. We need to start making things, acting, and don't just complain even after the thing is done. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much. Especially coming from someone as young as you, it's a pleasure to us, the elders, to hear you say this. I'm sure we'll all be listening. If anyone wishes to take the floor to comment on that, we have Barrack first, and then Seun.

BARRACK OTIENO: I just wanted to make a couple of comments basically on what we've been doing, and on the IANA transition. I think I want to say that we are on the right track. If I look at yesterday's meeting for the Africans within the ICANN community, you can see the room is full, so I think we need to encourage ourselves that more and more people are getting interested, and they're getting their minds in the right direction.

I think I also want to say that it's important that we keep talking about the Internet in the marketplaces, in the schools, everywhere on our continent. When I was looking around this city of Los Angeles, it's nice

and well-built, but, again, for those who have read the history of America, you will note that America was never what it is today. It took the Andrew Carnegies and John Rockefellers to make it what it is today. And I think Africa is really the next frontier. Here they've paved everywhere. What else can they build, or what more can they improve?

I think that gives us a bright future, that we have a chance to do for Africa what has happened in this part of the world, and I'm really happy to be part and parcel of this season, as they call it.

On the IANA transition, again, from an African's [ccTLD's] perspective, there are discussions. The challenges we are facing here are being faced in every other community, and I think I want to say that many of our people really do not understand the issues that are at stake. But the fact that we do not understand does not give us an excuse not to participate. I think those who understand have to share whatever little they understand so that the rest of the community can be able to understand. I think I want to suggest that, given the timelines that we have, let us go and see the using surveys.

A survey — you can say what you think, and the learned say numbers don't lie. So, because AFRALO is made up of At-Large structures, let's get the surveys out in our communities. Let everybody say what they think, or something, and let's take that. I think even nonsense makes sense to somebody else. I think let's go ahead and gather as much data as we can, and we'll be able to move forward. Otherwise, this is an important time in history, and I think we should not be left behind because of ignorance. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Barrack. You're right, it's a very good idea. You are right. We are going to try to do that at the AFRALO level. Now, before I give you the floor, there was Seun, who wanted to speak about the AFRALO/AfriNIC relation, and we have a signed memorandum, an MOU, and we were the first RALO to make that with the National Register with some corporation items between both of them. So I wanted to give you the floor to answer, so, Adiel, you have the floor.

ADIEL AKPLOGAN: For the corporation side, yes, we are strengthening and improving our relationship with the AFRALO. We have that MOU in place. We have a plan for the last AIS session with AFRALO. We are planning another session during the AfriNIC meeting that is coming up next month, so this is building up, and I think we're in a good track for that.

Coming back to the IANA transition, I fully agree with you, Seun, that maybe there is a need for stimulation that can come from the staff, and from people on the list, to allow more participation, because we don't have a lot of time. In fact, in many of the intervention, the capacity building, the understanding of the process came up several times, but the bad news is we don't have enough time to do this properly, so we will have to rely on people to read and maybe give us feedback so that we can explain things. For instance, I can point you to the page that we have put up on the AfriNIC website very dedicated to the transition. We describe the relationship between the RIR and IANA, where it comes from, and what exists today. We would love to have feedback on that,

so we can answer questions from the user community. So that can help the debate. That can inform the discussion on the mailing list.

We will try to put up a few questions. I'll work with the staff for that in the coming days so that we can have some substance before the roundtable that we are going to have in Mauritius. We will have to do this. We don't have a choice. It is unfortunate that we cannot meet, and we have to do it as well by taking into consideration the processes that are there that request from us more engagement and more reading — we cannot avoid that; we have to read. We will have to be everywhere to see what is happening elsewhere.

One thing that we are also going to do on that mailing list is to share more actively what is happening in the other forum, including name, area and other areas that can stimulate discussion on the mailing.

So, any idea or question that you may have, just go to the mailing list, and post them so that we can react to those questions to make the debate active.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Adiel. Yes, we are counting on the cooperation between AFRALO and AfriNIC, and we can do some capacity building. That's a good idea.

Rudi, you have the floor.

EN

RUDI VANSICK:

I'm Rudi Vasnick. I'm the Chair of NPOC, Non-Profit Operational Concerns, with the focus on representation of NGO in the ICANN debate, and I'm very amazed by the work you did, the professionalism, the participation, and the commitment of your group. I knew that Africa was going to participate and work on the Internet. Internet has put its end on Africa, and now you are inverting the roles and functions, and it's very important, because we need you.

You are the new innovators of the Internet that we need to have in 20, 15 years, ten years. There are a lot of pioneers in Africa that will show us that there is another Internet, and I want to show you to submit your statement in our group to ask for some support to your statement, because our members are NGO members. We all are NGO members. You know, I'm an ex-ALAC member, and I really want to try to build a bridge between the world that implements and the world that gives advice. So we are going to submit your statement this week, and you will have an answer before we leave Los Angeles so we can try to support you in your statement. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, Rudi. Yes, we are waiting for your support. It's very important for us, and it will give us a good meeting in Marrakesh, because the next meeting will be in Africa.

Now Hawa has the floor, and then Yaovi, then Andrew. No, first Andrew. I'm sorry, first, Andrew.

DIAKITE HAWA: Thank you, Aziz. I'm Hawa from Mali. I have an observation, a remark, that I wanted to tell you. First, I advise you to put a number so it is easier to find the recommendations. We think that, for a good, effective participation of the African community in the Internet, we need capacity building, so I support the outreach. But capacity building is very important. If the process must be finished in January 2015, it's too late. It's a pity. For capacity building, it's too late

But for the outreach of our community, I think that is very important. It is an added value for us, and for other capacity building on the IANA functions, we have two months. It's too late; it's too short. I wanted to put that part of our declaration out. It's a proposal I wanted to do, because we have a very short time.

Adiel, I wanted to tell you that the operational community that was implemented for coordination — that's good. We have to think about these kinds of communities for the IP and protocol, but this is on the technical side. I think that we also need to create a group for the organization; that is to say, a group for organization in which the political part will find its place to do some remarks. Also I think the composer of this group, I think we have forgotten the operational side.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay, Fatimata, you have the floor. You can answer.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Fatima Seye Sylla speaking, from Senegal. Hawa, thank you very much for your proposal. I think you are right. The outreach is very important.

You're right, but I think the capacity building can also be something very important, and we have to do it. There is a first level, a second level, and an advanced level. It depends on the people profile and the people with whom we are going to work, so I think it's not too late to work on capacity building.

If we want to do capacity building of a technical level, it's too short, you're right, but it depends on the profile of our learners. We always can do something for two, three months. If today they tell us, "You can do something," I think we are going to be able to do that.

DIAKITE HAWA: We are going to do some contributions on the current process?

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: I think that when we are speaking about capacity building, we'll think that we are going to give a networking course speaking about the IP address, but it's not about that. It's not a technical course or academy course that we are going to do on the process, or on the technical aspect or process aspect.

No, it's not about that. We need to explain how it works and what IANA really does for people to understand and give their opinions of what is interesting to work with those functions for the final players, so the final players can give their opinions. When the transition takes place, we can give our opinion to conserve or transfer something. It's not an academy course that we are proposing here, because it's not possible, and we know it. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you. Yaovi, you have the floor.

YAOVI ATEHOUN: Aziz, I wanted to complete Fatimata's answer, just a sentence. The capacity building session can be done through a webinar, and we do it normally. It's very easy to implement that, so we can do it. That was what I wanted to add. We can do a webinar; it's easy to do, and we can do it.

AZIZ HILALI: Yes, we have already done that. Yaovi, you have the floor.

YAOVI ATEHOUN: I'm Yaovi from AFRALO. Thank you for the work you have been doing. To the people who spoke about this subject, I want to tell you that it is a very important subject for me, because when you have a subject and don't learn about it, you are going to lose your time. This is why what people say before me is important.

                               About capacity building, I hear people saying that the political side is linked with what is happening, but if you don't understand what is happening, you will always take only the political side of the thing, and you can't participate. This is a problem, so the expression that we've put in our document answers to our worries or concerns, because we are from AfriNIC. AfriNIC also posted some things on this website. IANA people were here yesterday to speak about the functions and what is

happening, and what I want to tell you is when we come back in our countries, we need to see the people who are in charge to know what is happening, to know if they understand these topics.

If you don't understand, you can ask for the people from AfriNIC and ICANN to help us to better understand this topic, and to be able to participate, because if we don't understand those topics, we are going to take only the political parts, and it's not enough, because these are technical topics. This is why our political need to understand to help our community.

My message is that when you go back home, we need to tell everybody that we need to understand what is happening so we can contribute to this process.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Yaovi. Andrew, you have the floor. I said, "Andrew, you have the floor." Okay, Olivier, you have the floor.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much. I just wanted to speak about something that I learned yesterday. We always fixed ourselves on the date of the end of January 2015 with proposals that we are going to send by mail, and that we won't hear speaking about it anymore. But it's just the beginning of a process, because afterwards there will be public consultation, and other files that will be sent back to their users so they can modify them according to the public consultation.

So it's not a compressed process from today to the end of January 2015. It's a process that will go on — March, April — until the end of May, and then we will have a final proposal, a final statement, that we need to present to the NTIA. This statement needs to be perfect, so it's more important that this statement is acceptable and accepted than to have a statement easily and quickly made, and think that we won't hear about that any more.

So, for capacity building, it's never too late to build more capacities. As it was said, the webinars are a very good way to do some capacity building, so we need to do this capacity building. We don't have to think that it's too late. No, it's not too late.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Olivier. This is the first step. It is on the website, and the first step is finishing on the 15th of January, but it's just to receive proposals from the entities, etc. Andrew, you have the floor. The African-American.

[ANDREW MACK]:   A good bit of what I was going to say, Olivier just said.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Take the microphone.

[ANDREW MACK]:   Can you hear me?

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: [inaudible] can't reach here.

[ANDREW MACK]:   Feelings, nothing more than feelings… A good bit of what I was going to say, Olivier just said, so I will just add I think we are much better served by having a process that takes a little bit more time, but is better, and ends up in a better place. I think it's especially true, because there is a great deal of communication on both sides that needs to take place.

If we think about the small number of close friends that we see regularly at these meetings, and how small a number that really is — it's a much bigger number than it was, but it's still a very, very small group of people who actually know what's going on and can engage in this conversation. I was thinking not just about the people from the policy community, but we think about the small number of people from the NGO community who are significant users. We think about the small number of people who are representing African business that are here. To our young friend's future points, they're going to be the employers and the next Andrew Carnegies. So we need to reach them. They're not going to be immediately part of this conversation if we try to compress it.

I think there's a lot of reasons why this is actually beneficial to people in the home countries that we're trying to reach. There is technical capacity, for sure. There's also business capacity: understanding how to make yourself an active participant, and create the future, looking at

the jobs part of the internet as well. All of those things, I think, will take a little bit of time, and are worth investing time in. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Andrew. Adiel?

ADIEL AKPLOGAN: I'm going to try to answer the Hawa question, and I want to position this process in its context. I think that the process is well [inaudible] at an IANA stewardship transition, and when we look the stewardship transition, the NTIA has a contractual role between ICANN and the NTIA, and this contract has some special needs that are operational. This contract defines how the IANA function will be implemented, how its clients that are the three operational communities number, name, and protocols, and this is why this transition has been focused on these three elements. We don't have to forget that, at the same time, there is another process. It is the ICANN responsibility that is working in the [inaudible] way, and that is taking into account the political aspects of this process.

So we don't have to forget the second aspect of this transition; that is to say, the accountability of ICANN, and the transition part of the stewardship that is a transitional and operational transition about the IANA function, that the IANA function gives to these operational communities. This is why we have been focusing on these three communities. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Adiel. Okay, you have one minute.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I'm [inaudible] from Nigeria. I just want to know, [Andrew] raised a very important question on how to get our political leaders to understand, and I strongly believe that getting them to understand these issues will help a long way in making our participation better. What are we doing? How do we address that? That's just what I want to know.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible] I really understood what you wanted, but it's about supporting the [inaudible] development, vis-à-vis government. Is that what you…?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: She made mention of the fact that it's been difficult getting our political leaders to understand what the IANA function is all about to enable them to participate actively. I'm like, "What are we doing? How do we intend to address that?" Because getting them to understand the issues will help also in getting the African citizens to also understand better what the transition and the issues are all about. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I understand. I think this boils down to our homework, actually, that you don't just come here. At home, normally you should be thinking about the kind of multistakeholder model, whatever, so that some who understand could be able to discuss and make sure that those

governments or the other portions of society understand what you are talking about. That's one thing.

I also believe that when we do have these AfrICANN [inaudible] meetings and some of the people are there, maybe we need to factor in those specific issues. People are asking us why our governments are not so happy to just go to ITU meetings, and they will say, "We understand what the ITU is doing." No, they don't understand the stake here, so maybe we are the ones, at least on a country level, that are able to actually elaborate on those things.

Of course, as far as the African that are concerned, we also have this engagement — a mission that we do. That's where we actually talk with those high-level people and ministers, but my impression is that it boils down to how we do organize on a country level, necessarily. That's our homework.

But before I finish, I think Adiel alluded to something which is important. We may focus on the tradition thing. That's great, but the way the ICG and [inaudible] plan is working, this is addressing issues, but we should not forget about the three [inaudible] that are the main ones I see.

But the whole issue of ICANN's accountability — that one is important as well, and we need to think about how we organize ourselves, too, and that the positioning of AfrICANN, whatever, you can talk about those things, too. These are two different things, maybe, but they are also interrelated, so we need to bear those things in mind.

EN

AZIZ HILALI: Now we are going to close this discussion, if you will allow me, and if the staff agrees, we want to keep this room to give homage to two pioneers from Africa: Adiel, who is leaving his function as CEO from AfriNIC, and another person. Fatimata is going to speak about those two pioneers, and then they will have the floor.

Fatimata, you have the floor.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you very much. It's with a very great pleasure that I take the floor to give homage to Pierre Ouedraogo. He's a pioneer from the mobilization of the French-speaking community in Africa for their participation in all the levels in which ICT and the Internet are discussed: at the conception, political level, implementation, and assessment levels. If we are from the governments or private sector from Africa, or from the civil society from Africa, Pierre has always been working with us, helping us so our voices will be heard as the concerns from Africa will be heard and taken into account in all debates on development of ICT and development of governance of the Internet.

I think that if today there are so many French-speaking women from Africa participating in ICANN on the governance of the Internet around the world, it's thanks to Pierre Ouedraogo's support. He thought about strategies to implement so as to support our work, and so as to be inclusive with the persons that normally are not always participating online or in face-to-face meetings.

So, Pierre, I'd like to stress the women item because, thanks to him, the women were able to participate, and he encouraged us to do so. It is a

homage that we want to give to him. Pierre, you are leaving. You are retiring. You are too young to be retiring. I think you are going to still work with us because you are still young, and we need your experience. We need your help and company. I want everybody to applaud Pierre Ouedraogo to give tribute to him.

Pierre, I know that it is very late at home for you. Are you still with us? Can you speak? Are you still with us, Pierre? Okay. They are trying to call him.

As we wait for Pierre to join the bridge, we wish you had heard Pierre Ouedraogo first before we go on. Adobe Connect — that's where he has to log in. If he's connected on Skype, then maybe we can move the microphone in front of the computer for him to speak.

It's okay. It's fine, he's there. It's coming.

AZIZ HILALI: Pierre, can you hear us? He might be sleeping.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: As we wait for Pierre to be there, we have another brother, friend, and wonderful person who's greatly competent and effective. He's not old yet. He's very, very young, and very dynamic still. I've said he's young already, but I think repeating — how do you learn? By dint of repetition, right? This is pedagogic.

AZIZ HILALI: Mikes on, please. Otherwise it's not translated.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: I would like to give the floor to Adiel Akplogan.

ADIEL AKPLOGAN: I was just saying that it's wonderful when a woman says you're young. That's proof of the vitality you still have. I think that's what makes us proud on both sides.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: I would like to now celebrate Adiel Akplogan. I wouldn't want to introduce him, as you all know him already, but, Adiel, we certainly wish to thank you for your engagement and your commitment, because we all know it is very difficult to do so.

                               We're all parents, and we know it's not easy to raise a child to ten years old, and Adiel has certainly known how to do it whilst still striving to include all of the African community in the decision-making process, and in the way he managed AfriNIC. Adiel, honestly, as you launched AfriNIC in Africa — I think it was in [inaudible], wasn't it? April, 2004?

                               I wouldn't expect you to succeed as you did. It was a huge challenge that you faced and excelled at, might I say. Now, I would also like to say that I admire Adiel very much personally, and that I care for him very much, because he's a wonderful person. He's very nice, which is very important to us in Africa. He's very courteous. He has associated competence and skills with elegance and effectiveness and youth, as

Pierre said, so, thank you, Adiel. You are a true model to our youngsters in the continent, and I think many are going to follow in your steps.

I know it is but changing hats, but as I said for Pierre, you'll still be with us for years to come, and you'll still keep your integrity, your niceness, your effectiveness, and your youth, won't you? Thank you very much, Adiel. Thanks for everything, and the AfrICANN community – Adiel is here, so he can take the floor.

Oh, we have Pierre? All right, Pierre is going to speak first. Pierre isn't old.

AZIZ HILALI: Pierre, are you there?

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: Fatimata, can you hear me?

AZIZ HILALI: Yes. We [inaudible], Pierre.

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: Thank you. Thank you very much. I am greatly flattered. I wished to serve Africa and my community, thanks to the position I had the chance of filling. It was a great chance to me to be able to participate in AfrICANN to make my contribution as I did, by means of training young people, by getting to interact with politicians and the people in charge

of policies, and, most of all, I tried to do it all for French speakers, and for digital words, and for digital initiatives.

Even today, I've still had the chance to present a programming that will allow for the implementation of our new projects, and that is a great satisfaction. I like the depiction Fatimata gave of me, how she characterized me as being a nice person. I'd like to tell you that I'm with you. I'm always with you. I always stand by you, no matter what. Come what may, I will always participate in the domain names industry, and I'm sure we'll meet somewhere in Africa sometime.

In any event, I wish you all the best for the rest of your meeting, and I wish the community to stay together, and I hope for you all to be able to cooperate with your common intelligence, and do your best for Africa, for the Internet, and for the world. Thank you all very much.

Now I'm going to go to bed, because it's very late here. I'm in my pajamas speaking to you right now.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Pierre. We wish you great happiness in your future endeavors. Good-bye.

Now we're going to give the floor to Adiel.

ADIEL AKPLOGAN: Thank you, Aziz. Pierre, before you go, I'd like you to know that it is but a temporary exit, I'm sure, and to many of us you have been a model. To me, you have been a motivation for everything I've done, and it is a

great honor to me today to be here, and to celebrate this event, which I don't think will keep you away from the community for long. To us, you will always be an example of commitment, as regards to our African cause especially. Thank you, Pierre.

I would now, first and foremost, thank the community, as I always want to say, which is what we do with AfriNIC. Everything we did with AfriNIC was possible because the community trusted us, and because we have a community that's committed to what we do as well. A registry cannot be without a community to support it, to work in the development and policies, which in turn allow for its functioning.

AfriNIC was able to exist, grow, and mature things to the commitment of the community. The community has greatly matured throughout these last ten years, and to me, regardless of the growth of AfriNIC, I would like to say that it is the community that's most positive. It is the fact of seeing an African community that's committed to the governance of the Internet.

As for me, I'm not retiring. I'm still very much active, and I will still be active in my community in one way or another, but I think it is time, after ten years, to give way to someone else, and to allow the injection of new dynamism into this beautiful initiative which is AfriNIC, which finally allowed Africa to assume a sustainable position in the Internet governance ecosystem. The African position is recognized today, and it must be heard when it comes to discussions on IP addressing policies at the global level. It is unthinkable today of a position or decision being made at a level without taking into account the African opinion. To us, that is great progress, and we must go on protecting this ground we've

EN

conquered. Africa must have its full place in the global Internet governance ecosystem. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Adiel. I would just like to add that there is an image that comes to mind, and I always remember 2005, [inaudible], I think it was. I don't know what the meeting was any more, and the entire ICANN community stood up and applauded the creation of the last regional Internet network and registry, which is AfriNIC. You were there with all our African pioneers, so I'd like to thank you for everything you've done. You truly are a memento to African competence and skills, whether in the human regard, or the technical sense.

We have a small token of our appreciation. It's been made by our community, and I thank [Eve], who took care of this, together with Haja, and they worked very much to be discreet in preparing this. They worked via e-mail, and tried for you not to find out about this. We hope you haven't heard of this. Thank you very much, and now I will ask Gisella to read out a comment we have from Mamoudou. You all know Mamoudou. Gisella, can you please read it out?

GISELLA GRUBER: I have Mamoudou's comment. "It is a wonderful initiative, this joint effort AfrICANN meeting. It should be an example for the entire African community towards enhanced communication in our activities, particularly within the context of the IANA stewardship transition. Our communication should be prior to a good relationship of stakeholders,

and I think we need a common communication strategy to be able to inform our target. Thank you. "

AZIZ HILALI: Gisella, I love the way you speak French. Fatimata, there is something else?

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Yes. I would briefly like to thank the team who worked online to organize this joint meeting, this tribute meeting to Pierre Ouedraogo and Adiel Akplogan. We have a small gift. It is a token of appreciation for each of you.

Adiel, you're here, so I will start with you, because you're younger, too, and I think Haja should be the one to give out the presents. Oh, he wants to kiss Aziz.

And, for Pierre, Emmanuel is going to be the one receiving the prize, his award, and he will be the one handing it out to Pierre.

GISELLA GRUBER: I would like to explain that we're giving out gifts, in case you're wondering what's going on in the room.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you all. In the absence of comments, I would like to thank the interpreters very, very, very much. They are always here to help us, and

if you agree, we're going to approve and adopt the statement, and AFRALO is going to submit this letter to ICANN and to the ICG.

The meeting is now adjourned. Thank you very much. In Marrakesh, Insha'Allah.

GISELLA GRUBER: As information, if you wish to stay, from 4:00 to 5:00, we have the ICANN [inaudible] committee meeting going on in the Encino room. That is just below us in the California level. At 4:00, there will be a session of the Future Challenges Working Group in this room. Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]